

Arts & Sciences Inclusive Excellence 2016–2017 Report

Overview of A&S Inclusive Excellence Efforts for 2016–2017

All forty-one A&S departments/programs submitted reports for the 2016–2017 academic year. Of the nine administrative units (Guarini Institute, Leslie Center, Institute for Writing and Rhetoric, Neukom Institute, Rockefeller Center, Office of Undergraduate Research and Advising, Arts & Sciences Finance Center, Office of the Chief of Staff, and the Office of the Registrar), three submitted reports.

Broadly speaking, the reports captured much of the outstanding work being done by departments/programs and offices in this space, and their efforts serve as models for others moving forward. Several departments/programs limited their responses to checking a box to indicate whether an action had been taken and did not provide narrative information regarding their efforts. A goal for 2019–2020 is to encourage all respondents to offer both quantitative and qualitative feedback.

Below are details regarding these efforts for faculty and staff, broken out by recruitment, retention and mentoring/professional development. The development of the blueprint proved to be a valuable process, enabling the deanery to reflect on past efforts, codify existing practices, and chart future directions in support of an academic community that is inclusive and diverse.

Faculty

Recruitment

- In 2016–17, the A&S conducted searches in 21 departments and programs; of these, five departments conducted multiple searches. A total of 27 faculty members were hired, 14 of whom are women and 13 of whom are men. The ethnicity compositions are as follows:
 - Of the 14 women, 2 are Asian, 2 are Black/African American, 2 are Hispanic/Latino, 1 is two or more races, and 7 are White.
 - Of the 13 men, 1 is American Indian/Alaskan Native, 4 are Asian, 2 are Black/African American, 1 is Hispanic/Latino, and 5 are White.
- In fall of 2016, the Provost’s diversity liaison met with the Dean’s senior management group to review the hiring strategy for the coming year and what other steps might enhance our ability to expand the diversity of our applicant pools and increase the number of underrepresented faculty in the A&S.
- The Provost’s diversity liaison assisted eight departments/programs in the 2016–2017 searches. She worked with:
 - Biology to provide training and strategies for their searches, including use of anonymous balloting to allow department members to share their opinions on candidates more openly;
 - Classics and Linguistics on a broader approach to advertising their positions, which resulted in the postings appearing in a larger number of venues;

Arts & Sciences Inclusive Excellence 2016–2017 Report

- Computer Science, Earth Sciences, and French and Italian to ensure the greatest degree of inclusivity in the vetting, interviewing, voting, and hiring process;
 - Government on three searches (two junior, one senior), which resulted in offers to four candidates, three of whom are women and one of whom is African American;
 - Native American Studies (NAS) to develop more effective recruitment strategies, including a point-based scoring system to cull applicants in the first round to help avoid the effects of implicit bias.
- Additional encouraging results from the 2016–2017 faculty searches include the following:
 - Biology interviewed a record number of women and underrepresented candidates for their four recent faculty hires. Of these, two are women and two are from underrepresented backgrounds;
 - Latin American, Latino, and Caribbean Studies' (LALACS) candidate pool was large and diverse and included four Latino candidates each of whom came to campus for visits. The search yielded three hires, two Latinos and one Latina;
 - The chair of the search committee for Physics & Astronomy participated in IDE's implicit bias training workshop. Another professor in the department is actively networking to ensure a diverse candidate pool for a search for a professor of astronomy in 2018–2019;
 - Quantitative Social Science recruited four postdoctoral fellows, including three candidates of East Asian descent;
 - Women's, Gender, and Sexuality Studies recruited a full-time one-year visiting professor. The final candidate pool included four scholars, three of whom are from underrepresented backgrounds.
 - Additional comments related to recruitment:
 - In the last two years, a number of departments/programs have expressed interest in having postdoctoral fellows within their areas. As the recruitment process for hiring Society of Fellows candidates and Mellon Faculty Fellows lies outside of departments/programs, this makes it challenging for them to have these types of opportunities.
 - Similarly, departments/programs note the challenge of recruiting some of their top candidates due to the lack of employment opportunities for partners and trailing spouses.

Departure/Retention

- Four faculty left the institution for another position in 2016–2017. Three are from the Sciences and one from the Interdisciplinary Programs. Of the four, three are white and one is an African American woman.
- Seven faculty members were retained who had either received a formal offer from another institution or who had been heavily recruited. Of the seven, two are from the Arts & Humanities, two from the Social Sciences, and three from the Sciences. Six are white and one is Asian.

Arts & Sciences Inclusive Excellence 2016–2017 Report

- A number of department/program (Music, Anthropology) chairs highlighted their efforts to monitor the work loads of junior and associate professors to ensure these faculty members were able to make steady progress in their teaching and scholarship.
- Government and Sociology supported the efforts of junior professors to bring experts in their fields to campus as part of a visiting speaker and seminar series. These visits provided networking opportunities for junior faculty that could serve them well as they come up for tenure.
- Mathematics notes that hiring at the senior level is already challenging, and the constraints imposed in recruiting faculty to the Byrne Faculty Cluster further inhibits their ability to target a broad candidate pool.
- Women's, Gender, and Sexuality Studies retained a female scholar of color. The program highlighted the importance of communicating with departments where the program has faculty that may be "flight risks."

Mentoring/Professional Development

- Increasingly, both faculty candidates and existing faculty members are requesting information about the availability of mentoring during pre-tenure and promotion years, including information about advising and mentoring undergraduates, and securing internal/external grants. They also expressed interest in professional development opportunities that will help them become more culturally aware of differences and of what they can do to promote a more diverse and inclusive community.
- A number of departments/programs point to the unevenness of mentoring across the ranks and that it would be helpful to have more consistency and direction from the deanery regarding expectations for mentoring and professional development.
- We note below specific examples provided by departments and programs with respect to their mentoring and professional development efforts aimed at junior faculty:
 - The African and African American studies program (AAAS) paired junior and senior faculty to organize seminars and collaborate on committees that design new and innovative courses;
 - AMELL implemented mentoring lunches between the department chair and junior faculty members this past year;
 - Biology has formal mentoring committees assigned to pre-tenure faculty and is establishing new processes to ensure that the department chair discusses promotion and career advancement with associate professors;
 - Economics and Government each had several professors participate in the NCFDD "boot camp" last year;
 - English and Music regularly hold works-in-progress workshops for all faculty members to offer feedback on their colleagues' ongoing research and publications;
 - A senior faculty member in Education helped a junior professor revise a course syllabus to make it more appealing to a broader range of undergraduates;
 - Senior faculty in Music and Native American Studies attended classes led by their junior colleagues offering pedagogical suggestions;
 - Native American Studies recently hosted a one-day retreat so that all faculty could engage in a discussion regarding the mission and future directions of the program;

Arts & Sciences Inclusive Excellence 2016–2017 Report

- LALACS implemented a process so that faculty can actively mentor postdoctoral fellows;
- Psychological and Brain Sciences and Computer Science assign all junior faculty with a senior faculty mentor.

Staff

Recruitment

- The A&S conducted 24 staff searches for 2016–2017 resulting in 25 hires. Of these hires, 7 are exempt and 18 are non-exempt.
 - For the exempt staff, 2 are women and 5 are men:
 - Both of the women are white;
 - Of the men, 4 are white and 1 is African American.
 - For the non-exempt staff, 14 are women and 4 are men:
 - Of the women, 11 are white, 2 are African American, and 1 is Asian;
 - All of the men are white.
- As with faculty searches, most departments and programs now include equal opportunity employment statements in their advertisements for staff positions.
- Spanish and Portuguese successfully recruited a new administrator who is a woman of color.

Retention

- Overall, few departments and programs felt that staff retention was an issue; the loss of administrators in recent years has been largely due to retirement. That said, there seems to be consensus that expanded training and mentoring opportunities are critical to ensuring that staff feel that they can develop their professional skills at Dartmouth.
- One department chair in the sciences, however, noted that noncompetitive salaries contributed to laboratory and administrative staff retention issues.
- Biology expanded their exit interviews to include staff.
- The Office of the Chief of Staff for Administration & Advancement (OCOS) conducted “stay interviews” to better understand the interests and concerns of both exempt and non-exempt employees and will continue to do so as needed.

Mentoring/Professional Development

- Department/program chairs are advocating for staff to receive further professional development opportunities from IDE and HR.
- Departments/programs also expressed interest in having IDE and HR expand the number of mentoring and professional development opportunities for staff.
- One department administrator learned informally that a faculty member was considering leaving the College and wondered if there were any guidelines for communicating with the department/program chair about such faculty issues.

Arts & Sciences Inclusive Excellence 2016–2017 Report

- Department administrators are interested in more mentorship opportunities between department/program chairs and administrators.
- Several departments/programs raised concerns about department administrators being spread too thin, which often prevents their participation in mentoring and/or professorship development opportunities.

Action steps requested by the President and Provost

In addition to the 2016 charge for advancing diversity and inclusion on campus, which led to the development and implementation of the [DOF Diversity](#) Plan and [Blueprint for Equity, Inclusion, and Diversity in the Arts & Sciences](#), school deans were also asked to address a number of other issues, including:

1. Reviewing the tenure and promotion processes, and reporting on outcomes and proposed new practices;
2. Finding a rational means to measure and balance institutional workload, including mentoring, across the faculty;
3. Developing co-curricular offerings for students on cross-cultural communication, and supporting faculty governance processes working to establish an undergraduate requirement on human difference;
4. Asking faculty and senior staff to describe their efforts to enhance diversity and inclusion on campus as a part of their annual performance reviews.

The results of these efforts in 2016–2017 are as follows:

- **Review tenure and promotion processes and report outcomes and proposed new practices to the deans, president, and provost**
 - In spring of 2016, then Dean of Faculty Mike Mastanduno charged the Committee on Organization and Policy (COP) with reviewing Dartmouth's tenure and promotion procedures. In parallel the Dean and Associate Deans also conducted a review of the processes described in the faculty handbook. The COP gathered information from peer institutions on this matter and discovered that the tenure process varies widely among institutions and that each has devised a distinct system.
 - After careful review, the COP as well as the deanery determined that, while the faculty handbook required updating to improve clarity and consistency in the sections pertaining to tenure and promotion, we did not identify steps in our current process that would obviously advantage or disadvantage particular faculty members.
 - Final edits were made to the *Guidelines for Appointments, Reappointments, Promotion and Tenure for Faculty* and were incorporated into the [Faculty Handbook](#) in November 2017.
 - It should be noted that the COP suggested that a more extensive analysis of the appropriateness of the length of the tenure clock, the role of the associate dean in

Arts & Sciences Inclusive Excellence 2016–2017 Report

the process, and the relative contribution of service to the decision may be warranted and suggested the formation of an ad hoc committee for this analysis. The COP is the appropriate faculty committee to pursue these issues. This analysis was not on their 2017–2018 agenda nor on the 2018–2019 agenda.

- **Find rational means to measure and balance institutional workload, including mentoring, across the faculty.**
 - The COP was charged by the Dean in 2016 to review how service is defined, measured, and valued at Dartmouth. In their memo back to the Dean in 2017, the COP recommended that this matter be addressed at a future point by an ad-hoc faculty committee. The Dean of the Faculty will revisit this matter with the COP.
 - In 2017–2018 the COP did review the number of faculty committees and their membership with the aim of possibly reducing the number of committees and/or faculty membership while retaining their effectiveness. This effort is still underway, and recommendations are forthcoming.
- **Work to develop co-curricular offerings for students on cross-cultural communication and support faculty governance processes working toward an undergraduate requirement on human difference.**
 - For more than a decade, students have taken three courses—one in Western Culture, one in non-Western Culture, and one in Culture and Identity—to complete the World Culture requirement.
 - Between 2014 and 2016 a Curricular Review Committee (CRC), comprised of faculty across the A&S, reviewed the undergraduate curriculum. The CRC’s report made a number of recommendations, including that the three-course World Culture requirement be replaced with a “more carefully conceived one-course requirement.”
 - In spring 2016, the A&S faculty voted to approve a new distributive requirement for the A.B. degree that would provide all students the opportunity to thoughtfully engage with issues related to diversity and inclusivity. The faculty then charged the Committee on Instruction (COI) with crafting the specific wording for this requirement along with a plan for implementation.
 - The COI has developed clear guidelines for determining which set of existing courses and proposed new courses would meet this requirement. These courses must address Theories of Human Differences, defined as follows:
 - *Human differences are evident whenever and wherever people feel themselves to be different or treated as such by others. Each course that meets this requirement has two objectives: First, to provide an in-depth understanding of some aspect of human difference, such as culture, history, geography, ethnicity, gender, class, religion, sexuality; and second, to engage in a systematic discussion and evaluation of relevant theories of human differences that enable students not only to see and understand differences that they might not otherwise recognize, but also to account for such differences in ways that both respect them and work to explain them. Such courses may have a single or comparative focus, but they all involve explicit consideration of theories and methods that enable*

Arts & Sciences Inclusive Excellence 2016–2017 Report

students to think more systematically and critically about human differences.

- The final language that will allow the new general education requirement to be implemented was approved at the May 7, 2018 A&S Faculty Meeting.
- **Asking faculty and senior staff to describe their efforts to enhance diversity and inclusion on campus as a part of their annual performance reviews.**
 - The deanery added a section to the faculty record supplement form that asks faculty to describe their efforts to advance diversity and inclusion at Dartmouth.
 - The deanery recommends that HR add a section to the annual staff performance review form regarding employee efforts to advance diversity and inclusion at Dartmouth.

Selected Noteworthy Efforts Reported in 2016-2017

- AAAS noted that despite the predominance of minority faculty in their field, it is nevertheless important to continue to take actions in support of advancing equity, inclusion, and diversity across the institution.
- Departments/programs are offering a comprehensive array of courses that touch on race, ethnicity, gender, immigration, and cultural sovereignty, among other topics (see <http://dartmouth.smartcatalogiq.com/current/orc.aspx>).
- Several departments/programs report a concerted effort to bring a greater diversity of speakers to campus.
- Native American Studies plans to host semi-monthly program meetings, each led by a different faculty member, to engage colleagues in readings and conversations on topics surrounding diversity and inclusion. NAS faculty members participated in the Matariki Network's Indigenous Mobility Program conference in 2016 and 2017, and in 2018 will plan to host the conference here on campus.
- NAS also noted the launch of an off-campus program in the western U.S. several years ago has opened regular lines of communication with prominent scholars, activists, and tribal leaders in Indian Country.
- Theater is addressing issues of equity, inclusion, and diversity related to the operation of the department, course offerings, and public productions including recruiting underrepresented faculty and visiting scholars to campus. The department has brought in a consultant to help them explore issues related to the nature of the theater art form in which the human body and its various forms and abilities serve as the medium for creative expression. They are also committed to including American Sign Language (ASL) interpretation in all mainstage productions and offering additional accessibility via large-print programs, audio descriptions, etc.
- The DOF nominated the Provost's diversity liaison to serve on Dartmouth's Diversity Council, an institution-wide council comprised of faculty, staff, and students. The council, chaired by the Vice President for IDE, is charged with "addressing concerns that impact inclusivity for all members of the campus community."
- The Office of the Registrar has a large staff of professionals and student workers who represent a broad range of backgrounds, ages, genders, nationalities, and ethnicities. Most

Arts & Sciences Inclusive Excellence 2016–2017 Report

have undergone diversity training on campus and through the New England Association of Collegiate Registrars and Admissions Officers (NEACRAO). A representative from the Office of Pluralism and Leadership (OPAL) attended a staff meeting to discuss transgender issues and how to best address/work with those students in transition. The Registrar is heading a campus-wide “preferred name” initiative to support all students who desire to indicate their chosen name and worked directly with a transgender student to revise current business processes.

Future Plans - Challenges, Opportunities, Recommendations

- The DOF recommends the College establish a uniform equity, inclusion, and diversity statement that is used in all Dartmouth communications, including websites.
- The DOF recommends that IDE publish its recruiting guidelines as a web document.
- Department/program chairs and administrators will be asked to provide more detailed information in the “challenges, opportunities, and plans for the future” section of the blueprint reporting.

Mentoring

- The DOF has developed a proposed set of guidelines on mentoring and professional development for faculty at all ranks. The guidelines are intended both for those providing guidance and those receiving it. Associate Deans are soliciting feedback from their respective divisions before finalizing these guidelines. As of 2018, the current version of these guidelines is available [here](#).
- The DOF is also interested in working with HR to develop a set of guidelines on mentoring and professional development for exempt and non-exempt staff.
- Mentoring and professional development activities will be added to the blueprint as an action step, encouraging department/program chairs and associate deans to report on their efforts for these activities.
- Assistant professors will be encouraged to develop an action plan mapping out goals and benchmarks to help track their progress during their first six years.
- New associate professors will be encouraged to develop an action plan mapping out goals and benchmarks to help track their progress during initial post-tenure years.
- Associate deans will work with chairs of departments/programs to encourage assistant and new associate professors to develop these plans.
- Additionally, the deans will discuss these guidelines during the new department/program chair orientation held each fall.
- The deanery urges the College to allocate additional resources for mentoring and professional development in all academic and administrative units.

Professional Development

- Faculty and staff indicated that the diversity-related workshops were often oversubscribed, held at inconvenient times, or not well advertised. The deanery recommends that the College offer more sessions and that they be tailored for different

Arts & Sciences Inclusive Excellence 2016–2017 Report

constituents (faculty, staff, deans, administrators). For example, staff (exempt and non-exempt) are looking for particular strategies that they can use to advance inclusion and diversity within their own workplaces.

- Non-exempt staff would like HR and IDE to provide more mentoring and professional development opportunities.

Additional items

- The deanery is working with IT to explore the possibility of making the blueprint available online and allowing annual reporting to be completed electronically.
- Departments in the social sciences and sciences are concerned with their ability to recruit and retain the very best teacher-scholars without more competitive compensation and start-up packages.